# Non-Contact Methods of Measuring Stresses in High Temperature Materials

David R. Clarke

Qing Ma, Jun He, Don Lipkin, John Nychka

Samuel Margueron, Vladimir Tolpygo, Derek Gardiner

Everyone talks about the weather.. but nobody does anything about it

> Mark Twain (Samuel Clemens)

Everyone talks about **stresses**...... but nobody does anything about them

## Outline

- Introduction to Cr<sup>3+</sup> based luminescence and piezospectroscopy (luminescence and Raman).
- Phase transformations during the growth of alumina by thermal oxidation
- Latest developments on piezospectroscopy
- Modes of strain energy relief in oxide films and coatings
- Wrinkling, wrinkling kinetics leading to oxide film failure
- Buckling and buckle growth
- Conditions for spalling by the growth of buckles
- Large scale buckling
- Rumpling
- Monitoring damage evolution in TBCs by piezospectroscopy
- Summary

#### **Principal Types of Piezospectroscopy**

## Vibrational piezospectroscopy – Raman piezospectroscopy

#### Luminescence piezospectroscopy



#### Single crystal silicon



#### Sapphire containing Cr dopant

#### **Physical Basis of Luminescence Piezospectroscopy: Synopsis**



Octahedral coordination of Cr<sup>3+</sup>

**Piezospectroscopy Relation** 

#### **Electronic Transitions of** *d*<sup>3</sup>**Electrons**



Ambient pressure transitions in the visible



Strain alters ligand length and hence local potential on the electrons.

#### **Electronic Transitions of** *d*<sup>3</sup>**Electrons**



Ambient pressure transitions in the visible



Strain alters ligand length and hence local potential on the electrons.

## Cr<sup>3+</sup> Piezospectroscopy in Sapphire

In crystal coordinates, frequency shift,  $\Delta v$ , is related to stress:

 $\Delta v = \prod_{ij} \sigma_{ij}^c + \Lambda_{ijkl} \sigma_{ij}^c \sigma_{kl}^c$ 

where  $\Pi_{ij}$  are the piezo-spectroscopic coefficients.

Point symmetry of  $Cr^{3+}$  ion in sapphire imposes condition:

 $\Pi_{11} = \Pi_{22} = \Pi_a : \Pi_{33} = \Pi_c$ 

<u>R1 Line</u>:

$$\Pi_{ij} = \begin{pmatrix} 2.56 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 3.50 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1.53 \end{pmatrix} \quad cm^{-1}/GPa$$

R2 Line:

$$\Pi_{ij} = \begin{pmatrix} 2.65 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 2.80 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 2.16 \end{pmatrix} \quad cm^{-1}/GPa$$

#### **Calibration of piezo-spectroscopy coefficients**







**Piezospectroscopic Coefficients for R lines** 

	П11	П <sub>22</sub>	П <sub>33</sub> (cm <sup>-1</sup> /GPa	$\Pi_{11}+\Pi_{22}+\Pi_{33}$
<b>R</b> 1	2.56 *	3.50	1.53	7.59
R2	2.65	2.80	2.16	7.61

\* Parabolic fitting  $\Lambda_{1111} = -0.8 \text{ cm}^{-1}/\text{GPa}^{-1}$ 

#### Analysis for General Orientation

- In Crystal Structure Coordinates,  $x'_i \quad \Delta v = \pi_{ij} \sigma'_{ij}$
- Point Symmetry of  $A_{l_2}O_3$   $(D_{3d})$   $\pi_{11} = \pi_{22} \neq \pi_{33}$

$$\pi_{ij} = O \ \delta_{ij} \neq 1$$

10

- Deformation Frame Coodinates, x<sub>i</sub>
- Transformation matrix  $a_{ij}$ , thus  $x_i = a_{ij} x'_i$
- Thus, stress in crystal structure coordinates

$$\sigma'_{ij} = a_{ik} a_{jl} \sigma_{kl}$$

In general case

 $\begin{aligned} \Delta v &= \pi_{11}(\sigma_{11} + \sigma_{22} + \sigma_{33}) + (\pi_{33} - \pi_{11}) \left(a_{31}^2 \sigma_{11} + a_{32}^2 \sigma_{22} + a_{33}^2 \sigma_{33} \right. \\ &+ 2 \left(\pi_{33} - \pi_{11}\right) \left(a_{31} a_{32} \sigma_{12} + a_{31} a_{33} \sigma_{13} + a_{32} a_{33} \sigma_{23}\right) \end{aligned}$ 

• Pure Hydrostatic stress

$$\Delta v = (2\pi_{11} + \pi_{33}) P$$

Calibration for polycrystalline, randomly oriented alumina



Hydrostatic stress

**Uniaxial Compression to tension** 

#### Summary of Luminescence Shifts



**Piezospectroscopic Shift:** 

$$\Delta v = \prod_{ij} \sigma_{ij}^* + \Lambda_{ijkl} \sigma_{ij}^* \sigma_{kl}^*$$

(For polycrystalline alumina:  $\Delta v = (\Pi_{11} + \Pi_{22} + \Pi_{33}) \langle \sigma_{11} + \sigma_{22} + \sigma_{33} \rangle$ )

**Temperature Shifts:** 

 $v(T) = v(T_o) + \alpha(T - T_o)$   $\alpha_{R_1} = -0.144$   $\alpha_{R_2} = -0.134$   $cm^{-1}/C$ 

**Concentration Shift:** 

$$v(\%Cr) = v_o + 0.99 a / o Cr cm^{-1}$$

#### Effect of Stress Gradient



#### Stress gradient causes peak broadening

$$\frac{d\sigma}{dz} = \frac{3}{t\Pi_{ii}}\sqrt{\left(w^2 - w_o^2\right)}$$

Lipkin and Clarke, Oxidation of Metals (1995)

#### **Optical Microprobe Configuration**



## **Internal Stress Distribution in Polycrystalline Alumina**



Observation in transmitted light through cross-polarizers of alumna.

Variation in stress made visible through the piezo-optical effect.

Raman Piezospectroscopy

## Raman Piezospectroscopy



#### Raman Piezospectroscopy of Silicon



Active vibrational modes Transverse Optical --- TO1 along [100], TO2 along [010] Longitudinal Optical – LO along [001]



#### Raman Piezospectroscopy

1. Strain-free c-Si Polarizability tensor

TO <sub>1</sub>	TO <sub>2</sub>	Ю
$(0 \ 0 \ 0)$	$(0 \ 0 \ 1)$	$(0 \ 1 \ 0)$
$\mathbf{R}_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$	$\mathbf{R}_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$	$\mathbf{R}_3 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$
(0 1 0)	$\begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \end{pmatrix}$	(0 0 0)

Scattering efficiency

$$\mathbf{S} = \mathbf{A}\sum_{j} |\mathbf{e}_{j} \cdot \mathbf{R}_{j} \cdot \mathbf{e}_{s}|^{2}$$

Raman line frequency  $v_0 = 520 \text{ Rcm}^{-1}$ 

2. In the presence of a strain  $\varepsilon_{ij}$ 

 $\begin{vmatrix} p\varepsilon_{XX} + q(\varepsilon_{YY} + \varepsilon_{ZZ}) - \lambda & 2r\varepsilon_{XY} & 2r\varepsilon_{XZ} \\ 2r\varepsilon_{XY} & p\varepsilon_{YY} + q(\varepsilon_{XX} + \varepsilon_{ZZ}) - \lambda & 2r\varepsilon_{YZ} \\ 2r\varepsilon_{ZX} & 2r\varepsilon_{ZY} & p\varepsilon_{ZZ} + q(\varepsilon_{XX} + \varepsilon_{YY}) - \lambda \end{vmatrix} = 0$ 

Eigenvalues  $\lambda_{ij} = v_i^2 - v_0^2$ , i = 1, 2, 3

Frequency shift

 $\Delta v_i = v_i - v_0 \cong \lambda_i / 2v_0$ 

Deformation Potentials (Anastassakis, 1985)

 $p = -1.43v_0^2$ ,  $q = -1.89v_0^2$ ,  $r = -0.59v_0^2$ 

Raman Piezospectroscopy In Electromigration



**Phase Transformations in Alumina During** 

**High Temperature Oxidation** 

#### Reported Phase Transformations in Alumina Ceramics, Powders and Films



## Luminescence Identification of Alumina Phases



#### **Oxidation Induced Transformation Sequence on MCrAI vs NiPtAI**



#### **Alumina Transformation Kinetics on NiAl**



Phase identification by X-ray diffraction

**Grumm and Grabke** 

#### Nucleation and Growth of $\alpha$ -alumina on NiAl



**Oxidation Temperature 1100°C** 

## Luminescence Mapping For Transformation Kinetics





 $R = A + B \log t$ 

#### **Evolution of Stress in NiAl Single Crystal**



NB. Alpha phase is under net tension under transformation is complete. Then oxide is under compression.

## **Nucleation and Growth of a-Alumina During Oxidation**



**Origin of Transformation Stresses** 



 $\theta \rightarrow \alpha$  transformation is accompanied by a 9.5 % volume decrease.

The transformation is constrained by the surrounding  $\theta$  oxide, placing the  $\alpha$  - islands under tension. This causes "tearing" of islands.

#### Heterogeneous Nucleation and Growth of $\alpha$ -alumina on NiAl



Note the radial cracks in the islands, giving the "star" contrast



**TGO Morphology at 1000°C** 



1 hour  $\theta$  ~ 0.5  $\mu m$  thick



25 hour mixed  $\alpha$  +  $\theta$ 



#### Fibrous $\theta$ -phase Transforms to $\alpha$ -alumina



1 hour at 1100°C

25 hour at 1100°C

**Recent Developments** 

#### **Stress Effects on the Luminescence Lifetime**



#### Lifetime varies with crystallographic direction and linearly with stress

#### **Use of Polarization to Distinguish Stress Components**

Frequency shift proportional to mean stress in polycrystalline alumina:

$$\Delta v_{R2} = 7.62 \left( \sigma_{xx} + \sigma_{yy} + \sigma_{zz} \right) / 3$$



FIB cuts create a strip under uniaxial stress

Luminescence intensity – map around strip



#### Use of Polarization to Distinguish Stress Components

## Imaging under different polarization conditions reveals directions of principal stresses by affecting R2/R1 peak area ratio.



End of Part I